Enhanced nitrogen fixation in the immediate aftermath of the latest Permian marine mass extinction

Genming Luo1,2, Yongbiao Wang1, Thomas J. Algeo3, Lee R. Kump3, Xiao Bai5, Hao Yang1, Le Yao1, and Shucheng Xie1*

1Key Laboratory of Biogeology and Environmental Geology of Ministry of Education, China University of Geosciences, Wuhan 430074, China
2State Key Laboratory of Geological Processes and Mineral Resources, China University of Geosciences, Wuhan 430074, China
3Department of Geology, University of Cincinnati, Cincinnati, Ohio 45221-0013, USA
4Department of Geosciences and Earth System Science Center, Pennsylvania State University, University Park, Pennsylvania 16802, USA
5Nanjing Institute of Geology and Mineral Resources, Nanjing 210016, China

ABSTRACT

The carbon (δ13C) and nitrogen (δ15N) isotopic compositions of bulk organic matter were analyzed in two high-resolution Permian-Triassic transitional sections containing microbialite in south China. The results from these shallow-marine sections show that an abrupt negative shift in δ15N, from ~+3‰ to ~0‰, occurred immediately after the latest Permian mass extinction (LPE) in both sections, concurrent with a distinct negative shift in δ13C. The persistently low values of δ15N suggest that, following the LPE, microbial nitrogen fixation became the main source of biologically available nitrogen in the Nanpanjiang Basin and perhaps over a broader region of the eastern Paleotethys Ocean. Enhanced N fixation is probably indicative of the prevalence of stratified anoxic water masses characterized by intense denitrification and/or anaerobic ammonium oxidation at the time. Perturbation of the marine nitrogen cycle might have contributed to high temperatures following the main marine mass extinction through the release of the greenhouse gas N2O. The sharp declines in δ15N and δ13C may be ascribed to an abrupt change in shallow-water microbial communities, which differed in composition from contemporaneous deep-water communities.

INTRODUCTION

The largest mass extinction of the Phanerozoic occurred at the end of the Permian, and eliminated >90% of species in the ocean and ~70% of vertebrate families on land (Erwin, 2006). Whole-ocean superanoxia has been implicated as the direct mechanism of this extinction (Grice et al., 2005; Riccardi et al., 2006). However, details of the timing, geographic extent, and intensity of oceanic anoxia during the Permian-Triassic (P-Tr) transition are still being resolved (Algeo et al., 2010). Paleoredox proxies such as S/C ratios and seawater sulfate and sulfide S isotope compositions show high variability during the P-Tr transition (Gorjan et al., 2007; Luo et al., 2010; Riccardi et al., 2006), suggesting large and frequent fluctuations in paleoredox conditions. Furthermore, isorenieratane records indicate that ephemeral photic-zone euxinia began at least 1.5 m.y. before the end-Permian mass extinction (without any immediate effects on marine biotas) and continued throughout the P-Tr crisis interval (Cao et al., 2009).

Mass extinction events are generally defined on the basis of the metazoan fossil record. Microbes are rarely preserved as fossils and, consequently, we know considerably less about their composition, spatial distribution, and response to environmental stresses during such events. One characteristic of the latest Permian mass extinction (LPE) is that skeletal limestones are directly overlain by microbialites in many shallow-water settings around the world (Baud et al., 2007; Lehrmann et al., 2003). Microbialites, which were globally abundant during the Precambrian but declined greatly in early Paleozoic oceans (Riding and Liang, 2005), made a resurgence in the immediate aftermath of the LPE. These microbialites were inferred to contain cyanobacteria (Wang et al., 2005; Xie et al., 2010), although the microbial communities contributing to their formation have only recently been investigated in any detail (Yang et al., 2011; Chen et al., 2011). Here we present high-resolution δ13C and δ15N profiles from two P-Tr sections containing microbialite in south China, the Taiping and Zuodeng sections, to explore changes in microbial ecosystems, marine biogeochemical cycles, and seawater chemistry during the P-Tr crisis interval.

CARBON AND NITROGEN ISOTOPE PROFILES

Isotopic profiles for the study sections reveal sharp negative shifts in δ13C and δ15N at the level of the LPE horizon (Fig. 1). Pre-crisis skeletal limestones yield average δ13C and δ15N values of ~26.5‰ and ~24.0‰ in the Taiping and Zuodeng sections, respectively. A distinct negative shift of >2‰ occurs simultaneously with the transition from the skeletal limestone to the microbialite, producing a δ13C minimum in both sections at the base of the microbialite. δ15N remains relatively constant within the microbialite interval at Taiping except for a small negative shift in the uppermost part, whereas δ13C increases gradually in the microbialite interval at Zuodeng (Fig. 1).

The δ15N values in the skeletal limestone at Taiping range from 2.3‰ to 4.5‰, with an average of ~3‰, except for one black mudstone sample in the upper part of the skeletal limestone that yields a value of 1.4‰ (Fig. 1). An abrupt negative shift in δ15N, from +3‰ to +1‰, occurs at the transition from skeletal limestone to microbialite, concurrent with the decline in δ13C. In the microbialite interval, δ15N varies from ~1‰ to +1‰ with minimum values near the base of the unit. The low δ15N values continue well into the overlying thinly bedded limestone. The Zuodeng section has a δ15N profile similar to that of the Taiping section (Fig. 1). A complete description of geological background, methods, and supporting data for this study can be found in the GSA Data Repository.1

MARINE SOURCE OF ISOTOPE SIGNALS

Multiple lines of evidence suggest that the isotopic shifts at the LPE are not related to an increase in the proportion of terrestrial organic matter in the analyzed samples. First, the study sections were located in the interior of isolated high-relief carbonate platforms in a large marine basin (the Nanpanjang Basin; Fig. DR1 in the Data Repository). The carbonate content of analyzed samples remains consistently high (>95%) during the transition from skeletal limestone to microbialite, documenting no increase in terrigenous siliciclastic flux (see the Data Repository). It is unlikely that much terrestrial organic matter was transported to the study sites. Second, the strong positive correlation between the δ13C and δ15N (see the Data Repository) in these two sections implies a dominant marine fraction of organic matter. Third, the δ13C profiles of the study sections exhibit negative shifts during the earliest stages of the LPE, consistent with the shift observed in δ13C and δ15N values.

1GSA Data Repository item 2011203, geological background, methods, and molecular data, is available online at www.geosociety.org/pubs/ft2011.htm, or on request from editing@geosociety.org or Documents Secretary, GSA, P.O. Box 9140, Boulder, CO 80301, USA.
in the microbialite, different from the $\delta^{13}C_{org}$ profiles in sections that were contaminated by terrestrial organic matter (Cao et al., 2002). We infer that the $\delta^{13}C_{org}$ and $\delta^{15}N$ records presented here represent the isotopic composition of contemporaneous marine organic matter. Variation in burial temperatures is unlikely to account for isotopic shifts in the study units because the sections are only a few meters thick and all samples had similar thermal histories.

MARINE NITROGEN CYCLE DURING THE P-TR TRANSITION

Distinct negative shifts in $\delta^{15}N$ in the study sections suggest large changes in the marine nitrogen cycle during the P-Tr transition (Fig. 1). One potential explanation for these shifts is incomplete utilization of bioavailable N by photosynthesizers. However, incomplete nitrate utilization as a function of iron limitation occurs mainly in high-nutrient low-chlorophyll regions of the open ocean (Ganeshram et al., 2000) rather than in pericratonic carbonate platform settings such as those in which the units studied accumulated. Widespread development of shallow-marine anoxia in the Early Triassic (Cao et al., 2009; Grice et al., 2005) would have favored recycling of mineral-associated and organic phosphorus from the sediment to the water column, enhancing nitrate utilization. Enhanced continental weathering in the aftermath of the end-Permian crisis also would have increased the supply of phosphate and iron delivered to the ocean (Sephton et al., 2005; Xie et al., 2007). Therefore, it is unlikely that incomplete nitrate utilization was responsible for the sharp decline in $\delta^{15}N$ observed in the study sections. Chemoautotrophic bacterial activity generally produces larger negative fractions (to $-14\%$; Möbius et al., 2010) than those observed in the study sections (Fig. 1).

A more likely mechanism to account for the negative shifts in $\delta^{15}N$ at the LPE in the study sections is enhanced N fixation. The N isotopic composition of the microbialite ($-1\%$ to $+1\%$) is similar to that of atmospheric $N_2$ ($0\%$), consistent with the limited fractionation associated with diazotrophic (N fixing) marine cyanobacteria (Carpenter et al., 1997). Owing to the high energy demand of N fixation, this process occurs only when nutrient nitrogen concentrations are extremely low (Tyrrell, 1999). Strong N fixation in the Late Permian Nanpanjiang Basin implies a deficit of bioavailable N in contemporaneous seawater, which is commonly the result of enhanced loss of nitrate under oxygen-poor conditions. The main pathways for nutrient nitrogen loss are through denitrification, anaerobic ammonia oxidation, and/or burial of organic matter (Murray et al., 2005). Therefore, the $\delta^{15}N$ records of the study sections suggest an expansion of anoxic water masses following the LPE.

At a minimum, such N-depleted conditions existed across the South China craton, as evidenced by low $\delta^{15}N$ values in the correlative (non-microbialite bearing) beds at Meishan, located in the northeastern part of the South China block (Fig. 1; Cao et al., 2009). A negative N isotope excursion (to $-2\%$) is also found immediately above the latest Permian extinction horizon at Guryul Ravine, a P-Tr section in northern India (Algeo et al., 2007), suggesting that N fixation may have been prevalent throughout the Tethyan Ocean region. Furthermore, a small but sustained negative shift in $\delta^{15}N$ (from $-46\%$ to $-5\%$) begins at the LPE in the West Blind Fiord section from the northern Pangean margin (T. Algeo’s unpublished data), suggesting that the nitrate N isotopic composition of Panthalassic seawater also evolved during the latest Permian. Thus, the pronounced negative N isotopic excursions seen at Taiping and Zuodeng may be indicative of a broader, potentially global perturbation of the marine nitrogen cycle during the P-Tr transition, although more data are needed to test this hypothesis. The duration of this episode of depletion of bioavailable N may have been at least several hundred thousand years, as shown by the persistence of light $\delta^{15}N$ values to the tops of the study sections (Fig. 1).

---

**Figure 1.** Profiles showing $\delta^{13}C_{org}$ and $\delta^{15}N$ variations during Permian-Triassic transition in sections at Taiping (left), Zuodeng (middle), and Meishan (right). Base of microbialite represents latest Permian marine mass extinction horizon. Condont biostratigraphy is from Lehrmann et al. (2003). The $\delta^{15}N$ and $\delta^{13}C_{org}$ data in Meishan section were replotted from Cao et al. (2009) and Riccardi et al. (2007), respectively. Condont zone (C zone) in Meishan section is according to Jiang et al. (2007). H.p—Hindeodus parvus zone; I.s—Isarcicella staeschei zone; I.1.s—Isarcica zone; N.—Neogondolella.
Although not precisely dated, the microbialite facies proliferated from the Neogondolella meishanensis zone to the Isaricella staeschei zone (Yang et al., 2011).

Changes in the marine nitrogen cycle following the LPE may have had significant climate consequences. Trace metals are essential components of many enzymes, and their stripping from a euxinic water column through rapid removal to the sediment as metal sulfides may have affected the rates of certain biogeochemical processes (Saito et al., 2003). For example, copper is an essential component of the enzyme NOS (nitric oxide synthase), the only known catalyst of the terminal step that converts N\textsubscript{2}O to N\textsubscript{2} in the denitrification pathway (Buick, 2007). If strongly reducing conditions following the LPE (Grice et al., 2005; Riccardi et al., 2006) caused a reduction in copper in global seawater, then more N\textsubscript{2}O may have been released to the LPE (Grice et al., 2005; Riccardi et al., 2006) and a large reduction in \(\delta^{13}C\) at Taiping and Zuodeng had fundamentally different causes from the global shifts in carbonate \(\delta^{13}C\).

These differences in timing suggest that variations in organic \(\delta^{13}C\) and \(\delta^{15}N\) at Taiping and Zuodeng had fundamentally different causes from the global shifts in carbonate \(\delta^{13}C\).

### GLOBAL CARBON CYCLE DURING THE P-TR TRANSITION

Shifts in \(\delta^{15}N\) and \(\delta^{13}C\text{org}\) in the study sections lagged behind that of the marine carbonate \(\delta^{13}C\text{calc}\) record (Fig. 2; Luo et al., 2011). Fluctuations in \(\delta^{13}C\text{org}\) during the Late Permian–Early Triassic are known to be globally correlatable, indicating that they reflect changes in the C isotopic composition of dissolved inorganic carbon in seawater (Korte and Kozur, 2010). A large (3‰–6‰) negative shift in \(\delta^{13}C\text{org}\), reflecting a major perturbation of the global carbon cycle, began in the mid-Changhsingian, i.e., well before the LPE (Korte and Kozur, 2010; Xie et al., 2007). Luo et al. (2011) demonstrated that this shift occurred in two steps in both of the sections studied, the first >5 m below the LPE, and the second beginning ~0.5–1.0 m below the LPE (within the skeletal limestone) and continuing to ~1–2 m above the LPE (within the microbialite). These differences in timing suggest that variations in organic \(\delta^{13}C\) and \(\delta^{15}N\) at Taiping and Zuodeng have affected the rates of certain biogeochemical processes (Saito et al., 2003). For example, copper is an essential component of the enzyme NOS (nitric oxide synthase), the only known catalyst of the terminal step that converts N\textsubscript{2}O to N\textsubscript{2} in the denitrification pathway (Buick, 2007).

### NATURE OF MICROBIALITE COMMUNITY

Biomarkers such as 2-methylhopanes associated with \(\delta^{13}C\) records have documented the presence of diazotrophic cyanobacteria in P-Tr environments in deep-water facies (Xie et al., 2005; Cao et al., 2009). Some microfossils present in the microbialite have been interpreted as cyanobacteria (Xie et al., 2010; also see the Data Repository). However, we found no or extremely low abundance of 2-methylhopanes in the microbialite (see the Data Repository). Prevalent nitrogen fixation in the microbialite shown here indicates that diazotrophic cyanobacteria in the shallow-water microbialite might differ from the deep-water planktonic cyanobacterial community (Stal et al., 1984; Zehr et al., 1995) or some noncyanobacteria microbes might contribute, partly, to the N\textsubscript{2} fixation in the earliest Triassic microbialite. Zehr et al. (1995) found a high diversity of anaerobic heterotrophic nitrogen-fixing organisms in modern marine cyanobacterial mats. Our results, presented here, indicate that these diazotrophs might have flourished in the shallow water of ca. 252 Ma, and different N\textsubscript{2} fixing microbial communities existed in shallow- and deep-water environments after the LPE.

It is interesting to note that the \(\delta^{13}C\) values of the samples from the overlying thinly bedded limestone are similar to those from the microbialite layer, i.e., ranging from −1‰ to +1‰.


Manuscript received 21 December 2010 Revised manuscript received 17 February 2011 Manuscript accepted 23 February 2011

Printed in USA